

11-28-2017

The Need for Culturally-Based Palliative Care Programs for African American Patients at End-of-life

Ronit Elk

University of South Carolina, ELK@mailbox.sc.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.library.tmc.edu/jfs>

Recommended Citation

Elk, Ronit (2017) "The Need for Culturally-Based Palliative Care Programs for African American Patients at End-of-life," *Journal of Family Strengths*: Vol. 17 : Iss. 1 , Article 14.

Available at: <http://digitalcommons.library.tmc.edu/jfs/vol17/iss1/14>

The Journal of Family Strengths is brought to you for free and open access by CHILDREN AT RISK at DigitalCommons@The Texas Medical Center. It has a "cc by-nc-nd" Creative Commons license (Attribution Non-Commercial No Derivatives) For more information, please contact digitalcommons@exch.library.tmc.edu

Patients facing life-threatening illness often experience unnecessary and preventable suffering including extreme and prolonged pain, psychological distress, as well as unsatisfactory communication with doctors, all of which result in enormous strain on patients and caregivers (Chochinov et al., 2009; Kamal et al., 2011; Morrison & Meier, 2011). It is common for needs in the physical, psychosocial and spiritual domains to be unmet (Zhukovsky, 2000). As a result, the last few weeks and months of life, and that of their loved ones, may be additionally burdened with physical, emotional and spiritual suffering. Palliative care programs, interdisciplinary care focused on relief of pain and other symptoms in support of best possible quality of life for patients with serious illness and their families, or consultations with palliative care experts where such team programs are not available, have been shown to reduce symptoms, alleviate suffering, improve doctor-patient communication and satisfaction with care, improve family satisfaction, and enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of hospital services (Bakitas et al., 2009a; Bakitas et al., 2009b; Casarett et al., 2008; Lagman, Rivera, Walsh, LeGrand, & Davis, 2007; Morrison & Meier, 2011; O'Hara et al., 2010), as well as to be associated with hospital cost savings (Morrison et al., 2008; Morrison et al., 2011; Penrod et al., 2010). Palliative care consultations for inpatients have successfully identified unrecognized symptoms and unmet problems (Abraham, Callahan, Rossetti, & Pierre, 1996; Bailey et al., 2005; Bascom, 1997; Kuin et al., 2004; Manfredi et al., 2000), and have been associated with lower use of ICUs (Elsayem et al., 2006; Norton et al., 2007), lower likelihood of dying in ICU (Elsayem et al., 2006), lower costs of care (Penrod et al., 2006; Smith et al., 2003), and improvement in care processes, including medication prescribing and documenting patient goals for care (Bailey et al., 2005; Higginson et al., 2002; Higginson et al., 2003).

Despite palliative care's proven effectiveness, numerous studies have shown that African Americans underutilize palliative care and/or hospice services (Cohen, 2008; Colon & Lyke, 2003; LoPresti, Dement, & Gold, 2016; Ludke & Smucker, 2007; Payne, 2016; Rhodes, Teno, & Welch, 2006). Three reasons have been suggested: (i) A lack of exposure to information about hospice or palliative care (Johnson, Kuchibhatla, & Tulsky, 2009), leading to a lack of awareness of these options (Hazin & Giles, 2011; Wicher & Meeker, 2012). (ii) Values of End-of-life care practiced in the US may not be ones that hold the same reference for African Americans. Historically end-of-life care in U.S. has been rooted in values that represent the cultural and religious values of the white middle class

(Krakauer, Crenner, & Fox, 2002; Wicher & Meeker, 2012). What is perceived and promoted as advantageous to one group may not hold the same beneficial value to another group with a different frame of reference, value system and life experience (Baker, 2000). Two mainstream elements not consistent with African Americans include: a. An emphasis on individual choice, which conflicts with African American values that are more family-centered in decision-making, especially for life transitions (Mazanec, Daly, & Townsend, 2010). The importance of faith, spiritual beliefs and the church are key components for many African Americans (Wicher & Meeker, 2012). b. Spiritual beliefs are important in understanding and coping with illness, and provide a framework within which treatment decisions are made (Johnson, Elbert-Avila, & Tulsy, 2005; True et al., 2005), yet a recent study (Ernecoff, Curlin, Buddadhumaruk, & White, 2015) found physicians rarely asked patients about their spirituality. The concept of hope is a central tenet in the African American church (Kennard, 2016), and faith in God's healing power is encompassing (Mansfield, Mitchell, & King, 2002). This is often at odds with the sharing of a terminal prognosis by physicians (Payne, 2016). The African American church has long been a constant source of empowerment, social change and support (Mazanec et al., 2010), with pastors playing a key role in end-of-life care; however, only a few end-of-life programs consult with local pastors. (iii) Historical and social factors including slavery, racism, a legacy of medical experimentation and exploitation (Halloway, 2016; Payne, 2016), and ongoing racism and microaggression (Sue, 2010), have left a deep-seated legacy of mistrust in the African American community (Freeman & Payne, 2000; Shrank et al., 2005; Taxis, 2006). A recent report on race and inequality (Goldberg, 2016) found that in the US, African Americans and Whites are "worlds apart" in terms of perceptions of race (e.g., racial equality) and in reality (e.g., racial gap in household income). This is even more strongly felt in the six states of the "Deep South" because those states promoted slavery and had cotton as a major economic source prior to the American Civil War (Webster Dictionary.org, 2016). Another recent study (Sewell, 2015) found African Americans are more likely to believe physicians don't care about them as individuals, and are less likely to trust the judgment and personal competence of the treating physician. Patient-physician communication at end-of-life encompasses active listening to the patient and family, considering all aspects of the patient in a respectful manner, and creating a relationship based on trust and respect (Mack et al., 2009).

In an effort to bring light to the issue and to focus on bringing about health equity at end-of-life for African Americans, a special issue on *Palliative and End-of-life Care for African Americans*, was published (Elk,

2016). In addition to peer-reviewed research articles, African American leaders in the field were invited to write editorials. Although each of their papers had a diverse area of focus, Drs. Payne and Halloway and Pastor Corey all emphasized one overriding message; the need for healthcare providers to acknowledge and respect “the pernicious effects of past and present racism” (Payne, 2016), anticipating that “African American patients may have had experiences of being treated with inequity, disrespect and disregard” (Halloway, 2016), and recognizing that there are “...many despairs that can be experienced in a society that does not always see “all men as created equal” (Kennard, 2016). The editorial, “*The First Step is Recognizing, Acknowledging and Respecting the Inequity, Disrespect and Disregard Our African American Patients Have Experienced,*” emphasizes this as the first step in the process of achieving health equity for African Americans at end-of-life (Elk, 2016).

The second necessary step is for healthcare professionals to gain an in-depth understanding the culture of the particular group of African American patients we serve. Culture is a multi-level, multi-dimensional system that includes beliefs, attitudes, explanations, and practices that ascribe meaning to life events, particularly unexpected and uncontrollable events (Kagawa-Singer, Dressler, George, & Elwood, 2015). Culture fundamentally shapes how individuals make meaning out of illness, suffering, and dying (Kagawa-Singer & Blackhall, 2001). It also strongly influences people’s responses to diagnosis, illness and treatment preferences (Ersek, Kagawa-Singer, Barnes, Blackhall, & Koenig, 1998; Kagawa-Singer & Blackhall, 2001; Searight & Gafford, 2005). Therefore, in providing palliative care, consideration of the patient and their family’s culture is essential. Lack of sensitivity to, and lack respect for cultural differences may compromise end-of-life care for minority patients (Krakauer et al., 2002). Yet, culturally appropriate models of care that take into consideration the diverse cultural preferences of terminally ill rural patients and their family caregivers are not currently available in the U.S. We echo the need for research on the unique needs of diverse populations, and consideration of varying cultural considerations in end-of-life care expressed by so many (Association of American Medical Colleges et al., 2015; Bakitas et al., 2009a; Elliott, Alexander, Mescher, Mohan, & Barnato, 2016; Higginson et al., 2002; Lamont & Siegler, 2000; Mack et al., 2012; Sewell, 2015). The need to ensure culturally competent, high-quality end-of-life care for diverse Americans is not only a national priority, but has also been expressed as the largest US public health crisis (Periyakoil, Neri, & Kraemer, 2016). A proven effective method to conduct such research is by implementing community-based participatory research (CBPR), a collaborative approach

between academia and community members or organizations, in which community participation is an integral part of the process (from program inception to data interpretation). This method has been widely used in the last ten to fifteen years to address health disparities (Chau, Islam, Tandon, Ho-Asjoe, & Rey, 2007; Wallerstein & Duran, 2006). CBPR has been found to demonstrate positive health outcomes (Laveaux & Christopher, 2009), and to be extremely effective in both development and implementation of projects (Salimi et al., 2012). CBPR principles include recognizing the community as a unit of identity, building on the community strengths, collaborating with community partners at all phases of the research, integrating knowledge and action for the mutual benefit of all the partners involved in the process, and disseminating findings and knowledge gained to all partners (Israel, Eng, Schulz, Parker, & Satcher, 2005). Community input has been demonstrated to enhance both the quality and acceptability of interventions (Halcomb, Gholizadeh, DiGiacomo, Phillips, & Davidson, 2007). By using CBPR communities are respected, empowered, have ownership of the project, and make it their own.

It is recognized that research takes many years. Until we have the evidence-base that research provides, there are steps that palliative care programs can take immediately, over and above the first step so strongly emphasized above. This includes recognizing the importance of the church, spirituality and the concept of everlasting hope among African American patients and family, and including African American pastors as part of the program. Making time to get to know the patient and family, asking them what is important and relevant to them is a simple step, as is respecting the stated wishes and preferences, even if these don't conform to usual practice or care. By following these few steps indicated here, we can begin to lay down new paths so necessary to create health equity for all at end of life.

References

- Morrison, R.S., & Meier, D.E. (2011). The National Palliative Care Research Center and the Center to Advance Palliative Care: A partnership to improve care for persons with serious illness and their families. *Journal of Pediatric Hematology/Oncology*, 33 (Suppl. 2), S126-131.
- Chochinov, H.M., Hassard, T., McClement, S., Hack, T., Kristjanson, L.J., Harlos, M., ...Murray, A. (2009). The landscape of distress in the terminally ill. *Journal of Pain Symptom Management*, 38(5), 641-649.
- Kamal, A.H., Bull, J., Kavalieratos, D., Taylor, D.H., Downey, W., Abernethy, A.P. (2011). Palliative care needs of patients with cancer living in the community. *Journal of Oncology Practice*, 7(6), 382-388.
- Zhukovsky, D.S. (2000). A model of palliative care: The palliative medicine program of the Cleveland Clinic Foundation. A World Health Organization Demonstrations Project. *Supportive Care in Cancer*, 8(4), 268-277.
- Casarett, D., Pickard, A., Bailey, F.A., Ritchie, C., Furman, C., Rosenfeld, K...Shea, J.A. (2008). Do palliative consultations improve patient outcomes? *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society*, 56(4), 593-599.
- Bakitas, M., Lyons, K.D., Hegel, M.T., Balan, S., Barnett, K.N., Brokaw, F.C...Ahles, T.A. (2009a). The project ENABLE II randomized controlled trial to improve palliative care for rural patients with advanced cancer: baseline findings, methodological challenges, and solutions. *Palliative Supportive Care*, 7(1), 75-86.
- Bakitas, M., Lyons, K.D., Hegel, M.T., Balan, S., Brokaw, F.C, Seville, J...Ahles, T.A. (2009b). Effects of a palliative care intervention on clinical outcomes in patients with advanced cancer: the Project ENABLE II randomized controlled trial. *JAMA*, 302(7), 741-749.
- O'Hara, R.E., Hulln J.G., Lyons, K.D., Bakitas, M., Hegel, M.T., Li, Z., & Ahles, T.A. (2010). Impact on caregiver burden of a patient-focused palliative care intervention for patients with advanced cancer. *Palliative Supportive Care*, 8(4), 395-404.
- Lagman, R., Rivera, N., Walsh, D., LeGrand, S., Davis, M.P. (2007). Acute inpatient palliative medicine in a cancer center: clinical problems and medical interventions -- A prospective study. *American Journal of Hospice & Palliative Medicine*, 24(1), 20-28.
- Morrison, R.S., Dietrich, J., Ladwig, S., Quill, T., Sacco, J., Tangeman, J., & Meier, D.E. (2011). Palliative care consultation teams cut hospital

- costs for Medicaid beneficiaries. *Health Affairs (Project Hope)*, 30(3), 454-463.
- Morrison, R.S., Penrod, J.D., Cassel, J.B., Caust-Ellenbogen, M., Litke, A., Spragens, L...Palliative Leadership Centers' Outcomes Group. (2008). Cost savings associated with US hospital palliative care consultation programs. *Archives of Internal Medicine*, 168(16), 1783-1790.
- Penrod, J.D., Deb, P., Dellenbaugh, C., Burgess, J.F., Zhu, C.W., Christiansen, C.L...Morrison, R.S. (2010). Hospital-based palliative care consultation: effects on hospital cost. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 13(8), 973-979.
- Abraham, J.L., Callahan, J., Rossetti, K., & Pierre, L. (1996). The impact of a hospice consultation team on the care of veterans with advanced cancer. *Journal of Pain Symptom Management*, 12(1), 23-31.
- Bailey, F.A., Burgio, K.L., Woodby, L.L., Williams, B.R., Redden, D.T., Kovac, S.H...Goode, P.S. (2005). Improving processes of hospital care during the last hours of life. *Archives of Internal Medicine*, 165(15), 1722-1727.
- Bascom, P.B. (1997). A hospital-based comfort care team: consultation for seriously ill and dying patients. *American Journal of Hospice and Palliative Care*, 14(2), 57-60.
- Kuin, A., Courtens, A.M., Deliens, L., Vernooij-Dassen, M.J., van Zuylen, L., van der Linden, B., & van der Wal, G. (2004). Palliative care consultation in The Netherlands: A nationwide evaluation study. *Journal of Pain & Symptom Management*, 27(1), 53-60.
- Manfredi, P.L., Morrison, R.S., Morris, J., Goldhirsch, S.L., Carter, J.M., & Meier, D.E. (2000). Palliative care consultations: How do they impact the care of hospitalized patients? *Journal of Pain & Symptom Management*, 20(3), 166-173.
- Elsayem, A., Smith, M.L., Parmley, L., Palmer, J.L., Jenkins, R., Reddy, S. & Bruera, E. (2006). Impact of a palliative care service on in-hospital mortality in a comprehensive cancer center. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 9(4), 894-902.
- Norton, S.A., Hogan, L.A., Holloway, R.G., Temkin-Greener, H., Buckley, M.J., & Quill, T.E. (2007). Proactive palliative care in the medical intensive care unit: effects on length of stay for selected high-risk patients. *Critical Care Medicine*, 35(6), 1530-1535.
- Penrod, J.D., Deb, P., Luhrs, C., Dellenbaugh, C., Zhu, C.W., Hochman, T...Morrison, R.S. (2006). Cost and utilization outcomes of patients receiving hospital-based palliative care consultation. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 9(4), 855-860.

- Smith, T.J., Coyne, P., Cassel, B., Penberthy, L., Hopson, A., & Hager, M.A. (2003). A high-volume specialist palliative care unit and team may reduce in-hospital end-of-life care costs. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 6(5), 699-705.
- Higginson, I.J., Finlay, I.G., Goodwin, D.M., Hood, K., Edwards, A.G., Cook, A., Normand, C.E. (2003). Is there evidence that palliative care teams alter end-of-life experiences of patients and their caregivers? *Journal of Pain & Symptom Management*, 25(2), 150-168.
- Higginson, I.J., Finlay, I.G., Goodwin, D.M., Cook, A.M., Hood, K., Edwards, A.G., Norman, C.E. (2002). Do hospital-based palliative teams improve care for patients or families at the end-of-life? *Journal of Pain & Symptom Management*, 23(2), 96-106.
- Payne, R. (2016). Racially associated disparities in hospice and palliative care access: Acknowledging the facts while addressing the opportunities to improve. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 19(2), 131-133.
- Cohen, L.L. (2008). Racial/ethnic disparities in hospice care: A systematic review. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 11(5), 763-768.
- LoPresti, M.A, Dement, F., & Gold, H.T. (2016). End-of-life care for people with cancer From ethnic minority groups: A systematic review. *American Journal of Hospice & Palliative Care*, 33(3), 291-305.
- Rhodes, R.L., Teno, J.M., & Welch, L.C. (2006). Access to hospice for African Americans: are they informed about the option of hospice? *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 9(2), 268-272.
- Colon, M., & Lyke, J. (2003). Comparison of hospice use and demographics among European Americans, African Americans, and Latinos. *American Journal of Hospice & Palliative Care*, 20(3), 182-190.
- Ludke, R.L., & Smucker, D.R. (2007). Racial differences in the willingness to use hospice services. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 10(6), 1329-1337.
- Johnson, K.S., Kuchibhatla, M., & Tulskey, J.A. (2009). Racial differences in self-reported exposure to information about hospice care. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 12(10), 921-927.
- Wicher, C.P., & Meeker, M.A. (2012). What influences African American end-of-life preferences? *Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved*, 23(1), 28-58.
- Hazin, R., & Giles, C.A. (2011). Is there a color line in death? An examination of end-of-life care in the African American community. *Journal of the National Medical Association*, 103(7), 609-613.
- Krakauer, E.L., Crenner, C., & Fox, K. (2002). Barriers to optimum end-of-life care for minority patients. *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society*, 50(1), 182-190.

- Baker, M. (2000). Cultural differences in the use of advance directives: A review of the literature. *African American Research Perspectives*, 6, 35-40.
- Mazanec, P.M., Daly, B.J., & Townsend, A. (2010). Hospice utilization and end-of-life care decision making of African Americans. *American Journal of Hospice & Palliative Care*, 27(8), 560-566.
- Johnson, K.S., Elbert-Avila, K.I., & Tulsy, J.A. (2005). The influence of spiritual beliefs and practices on the treatment preferences of African Americans: A review of the literature. *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society*, 53(4), 711-719.
- True, G., Phipps, E.J., Braitman, L.E., Harralson, T., Harris, D., & Tester, W. (2005). Treatment preferences and advance care planning at end-of-life: The role of ethnicity and spiritual coping in cancer patients. *Annals of Behavioral Medicine*, 30(2), 174-179.
- Ernecoff, N.C., Curlin, F.A., Buddadhumaruk, P., & White, D.B. (2015). Health care professionals' responses to religious or spiritual statements by surrogate decision makers during Goals-of-Care discussions. *JAMA Internal Medicine*, 175(10), 1662-1669.
- Kennard, C. (2016). Undying hope. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 19(2), 129-130.
- Mansfield, C.J., Mitchell, J., & King, D.E. (2002). The doctor as god's mechanic? Beliefs in the Southeastern United States. *Social Science & Medicine*, 54(3), 399-409.
- Halloway, K. (2016). Their bodies, our conduct: How society and medicine produce persons standing in need of end-of-life care. *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, 19(2), 127-128.
- Sue, D. (2010). *Microaggressions in everyday life: Race, gender and sexual orientation*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley and Sons.
- Freeman, H.P., & Payne, R. (2000). Racial injustice in health care. *New England Journal of Medicine*, 342(14), 1045-1047.
- Shrank, W.H., Kutner, J.S., Richardson, T., Mularski, R.A., Fischer, S., & Kagawa-Singer, M. (2005). Focus group findings about the influence of culture on communication preferences in end-of-life care. *Journal of General Internal Medicine*, 20(8), 703-709.
- Taxis, J.C. (2006). Attitudes, values, and questions of African Americans regarding participation in hospice programs. *Journal of Hospice and Palliative Nursing*, 2(2), 77-85.
- Goldberg, L. (2016). Poll: Doctors want to discuss end-of-life issues, but barriers remain. *Research & Analysis*. <http://www.pewtrusts.org/>: The Pew Charitable Trusts.

- Webster Dictionary.org. (2016). "Deep South". <http://www.webster-dictionary.org/definition/Deep%20South>. Accessed August 17, 2016.
- Sewell, A.A. (2015). Disaggregating ethnoracial disparities in physician trust. *Social Science Research, 54*, 1-20.
- Mack, J.W., Block, S.D., Nilsson, M., Wright, A., Trice, E., Friedlander, R., Prigerson, H.G. (2009). Measuring therapeutic alliance between oncologists and patients with advanced cancer: The Human Connection Scale. *Cancer, 115*(14), 3302-3311.
- Elk, R. (2016). The first step is recognizing, acknowledging, and respecting the inequity, disrespect, and disregard our African American patients have experienced. *Journal of Palliative Medicine, 19*(2), 124-125.
- Kagawa-Singer, M., Dressler, W., George, S., & Elwood, W. (2015). *The Cultural Framework for Health: An Integrative Approach for Research and Program Design and Evaluation*. Bethesda, MD: National Institute of Health.
- Kagawa-Singer, M., & Blackhall, L.J. (2001). Negotiating cross-cultural issues at the end-of-life: "You got to go where he lives." *JAMA, 286*(23), 2993-3001.
- Searight, H.R., & Gafford, J. (2005). Cultural diversity at the end-of-life: Issues and guidelines for family physicians. *American Family Physician, 71*(3), 515-522.
- Ersek, M., Kagawa-Singer, M., Barnes, D., Blackhall, L., & Koenig, B.A. (1998). Multicultural considerations in the use of advance directives. *Oncology Nursing Forum, 25*(10), 1683-1690.
- Lamont, E.B., & Siegler, M. (2000). Paradoxes in cancer patients' advance care planning. *Journal of Palliative Medicine, 3*(1), 27-35.
- Mack, J.W., Cronin, A., Keating, N.L., Taback, N., Huskamp, H.A., Malin, J.L., Weeks, J.C. (2012). Associations between end-of-life discussion characteristics and care received near death: A prospective cohort study. *Journal of Clinical Oncology, 30*(35), 4387-4395.
- Elliott, A.M., Alexander, S.C., Mescher, C.A., Mohan, D., & Barnato, A.E. (2016). Differences in physicians' verbal and nonverbal communication with black and white patients at the end-of-life. *Journal of Pain & Symptom Management, 51*(1), 1-8.
- Association of American Medical Colleges, Braddock, C.H., Crandall, S.J., Gruppen, L.D., Nuñez, A.E., & Price-Haywood, E.G. (2015). *Assessing Change: Evaluating Cultural Competence Education and Training*. Washington, DC: Association of American Medical Colleges.
- Periyakoil, V.S., Neri, E., & Kraemer, H. (2016). Patient-reported barriers to high-quality, end-of-life care: A multiethnic, multilingual, mixed-methods Study. *Journal of Palliative Medicine, 19*(4), 373-379.

- Chau, T.S., Islam, N., Tandon, D., Ho-Asjoe, H., & Rey, M. (2007). Using community-based participatory research as a guiding framework for health disparities research centers. *Progress in Community Health Partnerships*, 1(2), 195-205.
- Wallerstein, N.B., & Duran, B. (2006). Using community-based participatory research to address health disparities. *Health Promotion Practice*, 7(3), 312-323.
- Laveaux, D., & Christopher, S. (2009). Contextualizing CBPR: Key principles of CBPR meet the indigenous research context. *Pimatisiwin*, 7(1), 1.
- Salimi, Y., Shahandeh, K., Malekafzali, H., Loori, N., Kheiltash, A., Jamshidi, E... Majdzadeh, R. (2012). Is community-based participatory research (CBPR) useful? A systematic review on papers in a decade. *International Journal of Preventive Medicine*, 3(6), 386-393.
- Israel, B.A., Eng, E., Schulz, A.J., Parker, E.A., & Satcher, D. (2005). *Methods in community-based participatory research for health*, 1st ed. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Halcomb, E.J., Gholizadeh, L., DiGiacomo, M., Phillips, J., & Davidson, P.M. (2007). Literature review: Considerations in undertaking focus group research with culturally and linguistically diverse groups. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 16(6), 1000-1011.